

**When
Values
Conflict**

**Essays on
Environmental Analysis,
Discourse, and Decision**

Published for the American Academy of Arts and Sciences
a companion volume to *When Values Conflict*
Feiverson, H.A., F.W. Sinden, R.H. Socolow eds.
*Boundaries of Analysis: An Inquiry Into the Tocks Island
Dam Controversy*

When Values Conflict

**Essays on Environmental
Analysis, Discourse, and Decision**

Edited by:
Laurence H. Tribe
Corinne S. Schelling
John Voss

Published for the American Academy of Arts and Sciences

Ballinger Publishing Company • Cambridge, Massachusetts
A Subsidiary of Harper & Row, Publishers, Inc.



This book is printed on recycled paper.

“This book was prepared with the support of National Science Foundation Grant No. ESR 72-03540. However, any opinions, findings, conclusions or recommendations expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of NSF.”

Copyright © 1976 by the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic mechanical photocopy, recording or otherwise, without the prior written consent of the publisher.

International Standard Book Number: 0-88410-431-1

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-45448

Printed in the United States of America

When Values Conflict.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Environmental policy—United States—Addresses, essays, lectures.

2. Social values—Addresses, essays, lectures.

HC110.E5W5

333.7

75-45448

ISBN 0-88410-431-1



Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
Preface	ix
Chapter One Failures of Discourse: Obstacles to the Integration of Environmental Values into Natural Resource Policy	1
<i>Robert H. Socolow</i>	
Chapter Two The Tocks Island Dam Controversy	35
<i>Irene Taviss Thomson</i>	
Chapter Three Ways Not to Think About Plastic Trees	61
<i>Laurence H. Tribe</i>	
Chapter Four The Rights of Nature	93
<i>Charles Frankel</i>	
Chapter Five Environmental Decision Making: Analysis and Values	115
<i>Harvey Brooks</i>	
Chapter Six Policy Analysis as Heuristic Aid: The Design of Means, Ends, and Institutions	137
<i>Henry S. Rowen</i>	
Chapter Seven An Afterword: Humane Values and Environmental Decisions	153
<i>Robert Dorfman</i>	

vi Contents

Index 175

About the Contributors 179



Acknowledgments

This book and the companion volume, *Boundaries of Analysis: An Inquiry into the Tocks Island Dam Controversy*, are the products of a several-year study which the American Academy of Arts and Sciences was able to carry out in part because of a grant from the National Science Foundation, under its Research Applied to National Needs (RANN) program. On behalf of the Academy, we want in particular to express our gratitude to Dr. Larry W. Tombaugh, Division of Advanced Environmental Research and Technology, NSF, whose broad experience in environmental problems, continuing interest in our project, and perceptive criticisms of our efforts as they developed were major factors in shaping this study.

We want also to express appreciation to the many people who participated at one stage or another in the series of meetings at which the ideas for the essays in this volume and the companion volume germinated and gradually took shape. Although we cannot mention all of them here, we must make an exception in the case of several who were particularly helpful to the editors and authors. Special acknowledgment is due to Bruce Ackerman, Raymond Bauer, Alvin Enthoven, Leo Marx, Guy Pauker, Wallace Stegner, Lynn White, Jr., and Richard Zeckhauser, each of whom in his own way made a unique contribution to the contents of this and the companion volume. And, as all of those involved in this study know, it was Murray Gell-Mann of the California Institute of Technology who started us on our way by asking some very difficult questions. Finally, had it not been for the generosity of the Committees on Research Funds of the American Academy we could not have accepted the challenge that Professor Gell-Mann's questions posed and undertaken the essential exploratory stages of this project to the point where a coherent study plan emerged.

The Editors

